ALTERNATIVE BANKING CHANNELS AND ECONOMIC GROWTH IN NIGERIA

DAMOLA. A. ODEWALE
Finance and Banking Department,
Faculty of Management Sciences,
University of Port Harcourt, Choba, Port Harcourt,
Nigeria.

AND

EMEKA J. OKEREKE PhD.
Finance and Banking Department,
Faculty of Management Sciences,
University of Port Harcourt, Choba, Port Harcourt,
Nigeria.

Abstract

With the introduction of electronic banking and cashless policy, it is speculated that asides reduction of robbery attack in the society, cashless policy has the potential to reduce risks and costs associated with cash mobilization, and therefore influence help the general performance of the economy in Nigeria. Hence, the need for this study become justified. This study examines the implication of alternative banking channels delivery and economic growth in Nigeria using quarterly data sourced from Central Bank of Nigeria Statistical Bulletin for the periods 2009 to 2020. The study employed multiple regression. Findings provided evidence supporting the fact that point of sale transaction has a significant relationship with gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria. Meanwhile, Automated Teller Machine and internet banking exhibited a negative correlation with gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria. The negative contribution of Automated Teller Machine and internet banking to gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria could be attributed to high volume of fraudulent activities associated with this version of cashless policy and excessive charges on such transactions which could result to financial exclusion. Therefore, this study recommends that there is need for regular Public Enlightenment Awareness campaign about the cashless economy so that everyone will be well educated and familiarized with it. Such campaign is an opportunity to make people also understand the consequences of the cashless economy.

Introduction

Alternative banking delivery channels are new conduits and techniques for providing banking services directly to customers and this involves the use of electronic devices through the internet to effect banking operations and management, this could also be known as electronic banking, (Nwaiwu and Momoh-Musa, 2021). The concept of electronic banking according to Nanna (2003) in Idoko, Ibrahim and Bala (2015) is the execution of banking services by financial institutions and their customers through the use of electronic devices such as Internet banking. With the advancements in information technology, various banking industries in Nigeria were mandated to be connected to the Internet.

Over the years, the Central Bank of Nigeria (CBN) has engaged in series of reforms aimed at making the Nigerian payment system formidable, and these reforms were meant to enhance the overall economic performance of Nigeria so as to place it on the right path and in tune with global trends. Since Nigeria's independence in 1960, successive reforms such as the change in economic and banking policies mainly targeted at stabilizing the economy have been channeled at enhancing social welfare and achieving other economic developmental goals, (Agu and Agu, 2020).

Modern technology has changed the original method of payment system into a more efficient and effective system, devoid of cash and carry syndrome, easiness of transacting economic substances as well as a safer and quicker access to funds, among other factors, and this has made electronic payment system a more elevated pace than cash-based system Interesting, in Nigeria, electronic payment system is gaining prominence to the extent that users have now preferred to carry out monetary exchange without visiting banks, Babatunde (2017). The increasingly competitive environment in the financial service market has resulted in pressure to develop and utilize alternative delivery channels.

The most recently delivery channel introduced is online banking, online banking is otherwise referred to as electronic banking; and electronic banking, similarly is termed e-banking. Online or electronic banking systems give everybody the opportunity for easy access to banking activities, thus promoting financial inclusion. These banking activities may include retrieving an account balance, electronic money transfers and retrieving an account history electronically. Electronic banking (E-banking) has gradually become an indispensable part of modern day banking services. All over the world, banking industry is one of the industries that have adopted technology which helped in rendering better and quality services to customers, this quality of service is enhanced using technological innovations. Technological innovations have continued to engender speed of transactions and prompt service delivery in banks, thus promoting customers' convenience and satisfaction. Edoka (2019).

Thus, one of the most remarkable innovations that have taken place in the Nigerian financial system recently is the use of electronic payment system for banking and other financial transactions. According to Chijioke and Paulinus (2019), electronic banking is a driving force that is changing the landscape of the banking industry in Nigeria, as it has blurred the boundaries between different financial institutions, enabled new financial products and services and made

existing financial services available in different packages.

Put differently, electronic payment system or electronic banking refers to the application of improved and faster information communication technology to banking especially in payment activities.

Anyanwokoro (2016) in (Adekunle and Ayeni, 2021) defined electronic banking as the application of computerized technology to banking activities especially as it concerns deposit transfer aspects of banking, also went further to define e-banking as a system of banking with an electronic banking system which involves an on-line processing of the same day credit and debit transfers of funds between member institutions of a clearing system.

Statement of Problem

Electronic banking is a driving force that is changing the landscape of the banking environment fundamentally towards a more competitive industry (Abass and Cross,2019). Electronic banking has blurred the boundaries between different financial institutions, enabled new financial products and services, and made existing financial services available in different packages, but the influences of electronic banking go far beyond this. The developments in e-banking together with other financial innovativeness are constantly bringing new challenges to finance theory and changing people's understanding of the financial system.

The Nigerian financial system is dominated by the money market, which is designed as a means of liquidity adjustment and also a potential path for economic growth and development, Eze and Egoro (2016). As a corollary, the efficiency of payment system, and of course, the ease with which transactions are perfected in the system is very vital in its proper functioning and profitability, (Ene, Abba and Fatokun, 2019).

Electronic banking emerged to enable the banking system achieve the required vibrancy that is expected and it is expected that with the emergence of electronic banking in Nigeria and the extent at which it has been embraced by the Nigerian banking system, the performance and profitability of deposit money banks will be enhanced, thereby enhancing the overall performance of the economy, Eze and Egoro (2016). Over the years, the banks have introduced different shades of electronic banking channels, all with a view to achieving enhanced efficiency, effectiveness, and a sound economy.

This however, does not, mean that the Nigerian banking system is not efficient enough: it goes a long way to explain that there is serious need to evaluate its performance and profitability in relation to the various channels of e-banking introduced into the system. The system should be deep and broad to be able to absorb large volumes of transactions with attendant cost saving benefits. (Okafor, 2012). Over the years, the Nigerian commercial banks have been associated with weak domestic payment systems, which have also hindered efficient liquidity management and have obstructed the development of the banking system. There is, therefore, need to investigate various e-banking channels in order to assess their individual well-being as well as combined contributions to the financial performance and profitability of deposit money banks and the economy at large. Given the above scenario, therefore, this study focuses on finding how e-banking has been able to enhance the Nigerian economy.

Aim and Objectives of the study

The aim of the study is to examine the impact of alternative banking channels delivery on Nigerian economic growth, while the objectives are to;

- Determine the impact of automated teller machine (ATM) transaction on gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria.
- Ascertain the influence of Point of Sales (POS) terminal transactions on gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria.
- Investigate the contribution of Electronic Mobile Banking (EMB) on gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria.
- Evaluate the impact of Internet (WEB) Banking transactions on gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria.

Research Questions

The study seeks to provide answers to the following research questions as a guide to achieving the above stated objectives:

1. How do automated teller machine (ATM) transactions impact on gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria?
2. To what extent do Point of Sales (POS) terminal transactions influence the gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria?
3. Do Electronic Mobile Banking (EMB) significantly contribute to the gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria?
4. What is the impact of Internet (WEB) Banking transactions on the profitability of commercial banks in Nigeria?

Review of Related Literatures
Conceptual Issues
Alternative Banking \ Electronic Banking in Nigeria

Alternative banking also known as electronic banking is a kind of banking that involves electronic form of money transaction. Here banking services are fully automated such that transactions are concluded in a jiffy, (Ahmadu, 2014). It involves the use of computer network in dispensing cash and transfers of fund. The primary objectives are to replace intensive labour operation and thus help reduce the waiting time of customers.

In Nigeria, there are various electronic banking activities which involve the automated teller machine, point of sale service, internet banking, electronic funds transfer, and the likes. It also includes electronic devices such as SQL and MICR. The emergence of e-banking products brings to an end the era of mechanical and laborious banking. E-banking means not only electronic production, like, for instance, opening a letter of credit, but also the customer requests the services by electronic means and that the bank supplies it the very same way. In banking operations, technical change encompasses the marketing and distribution function in addition to production, various e-banking channels and products existing within and outside the Nigerian's Financial System shall subsequently be discussed in this study.

According to Onodugo (2015), e-banking is not something totally new. It started some time ago in the form of ATMs and telephone transactions. This first generation of solutions typically only allowed customers to view their statements online, conduct transfers between accounts and pay

bills (Obiri et al, 2013) as cited in (Okereke, 2016). Nowadays, the amount of operations that can be carried out using e-banking services is far greater. Customers can use e-banking to: pay utility bills and insurance premiums; fund transfer; consult current account and savings balances; carryout mortgage payments; current, savings and all manner of account openings, options subscriptions; book orders online; book flights and railway tickets; and, purchase products online.

Electronic payment and the cashless policy

Electronic based transactions are a major tool used to discourage high circulation of cash in any economy. It is also the bases for the implementation of cashless policy in Nigeria. Electronic cash is a system that allows individuals purchase goods or services in today's society without the exchange of anything tangible.

The term money still exists, but it is more in an electronic form. This is more acceptable as the world over makes a shift towards a cashless society which is being sold as a more convenient method of payment and a method of preventing crimes all the way from robbery of cash from individuals to the extent of money laundering among crime syndicates and cash stockpiling at home by corrupt government officials, Chukwu and Idoko, (2021).

The CBN also defines electronic banking channels as the provision of retail and small value banking product and services through electronic channels. Such products and service can include deposit taking, lending, account management, provision of financial advice, electronic bill payment and the provision of other electronic payment product and service such as e-money. Below are some of the e-

banking product and services that is pivotal to implementation of the cashless policy from the CBN report.

Alternative Banking Channels \ Electronic Payment Channels
Automated Teller Machine

Automated Teller Machine is a computer controlled device that dispenses cash and provides other services to customers who identify them with a personal identification number (PIN). The physical carriage of cash as well as frequent visit to the banks is being reduced with the aid of ATM, (Okafor, 2020).

The principal advantage of ATM is that it dispenses cash at any time of the day even as it needs not to be located within the banking premises but in stores, shopping malls, fuel stations and so other strategic places as might be deem fit by each deposit money bank, unlike the traditional method where customers have to queue for a very long period of time to withdraw cash, deposit cash or transfer funds.

Internet Banking

Internet banking refers to systems that enable bank customers to get access to their accounts and general information on bank products and services through the use of bank's website, without the intervention or inconvenience of sending letters, faxes, original signatures and telephone confirmations (Olorunsegun, 2010).

Siyanbola (2013) puts it that internet banking involves conducting banking transactions on the internet (www) using electronic tools such as the computer without visiting the banking hall.

Point of Sale (POS) Terminals

These are used by merchants in the day-to-day business running. It enables customers to make payments via their ATM

cards by slotting them into the POS terminal. As the POS terminals are linked to the merchant's bank account online real-time just as the customer's bank cards are; once payment is successfully made via the POS account, customer's bank account is debited immediately and that of the merchant is credited for the value of purchases made or services enjoyed. (Oyetade and Ofoelue, 2012).

Theoretical Postulations

The theoretical basis for this study is provided by these theories.

There have been no generalized theory guiding the use of electronic banking, but studies on the subject matter depends on theories that advocate for innovations, technological advancement and improvements in the financial and banking system.

Technology Acceptance Theory (TAM)

Technology acceptance theory as postulated by Fred Davis in 1985 emphasized that individuals accept and use a technology based on two key factors namely perceived usefulness (PU) and perceived ease-of-use (PEOU). Here, perceived usefulness refers to the degree to which an individual believes that a particular technology would enhance his job performance. On the other hand, perceived ease-of-use refers to the degree to which an individual believes that the use of a particular technology would be effortless. Based on the technology acceptance theory, the acceptance of a technology is therefore dependent on individuals' belief that the usage of the technology will be easy and that it will help him to perform better.

Theory favors this study because cashless policy is basically introduced to accelerate financial transactions thereby enhancing financial inclusion and increase economic growth (Ajayi, 2014). The technology acceptance theory is one of the theories that have been developed to provide a better understanding of the usage and adoption of information technology. It is presently a prominent theory used in modeling technology acceptance and adoption in information systems research.

Diffusion of Innovation Theory (DOI)

This theory seeks to clarify how, why, and at what rate new ideas and technology spread through cultures and societies. According to this theory, diffusion is the method of communicating innovation by certain channels over a period of time among members of a social system. In the diffusion of innovation theory, culture plays important role in determining how individuals living in a community, state or a nation accepts or rejects any technological innovations, this theory could be used in explaining the different levels of acceptance of cashless policy. It tends to explain why some countries or segment of the society embraced cashless policy using the instrument of electronic payment whereas some others are yet to key into this phenomenon.

This theory also favours this study because it explains the rate at which cashless policy has been accepted in Nigeria and the penetration of the electronic payment methods in Nigeria. Diffusion of Innovations (DOI) theory also known as Innovation Diffusion Theory (IDT) consists of six major components: innovation characteristics, individual user characteristics, adopter distribution over time, diffusion networks, innovativeness and adopter categories, and the individual adoption process. Arguably the most popular of the six components of

IDT centers on the characteristics of the innovation itself.

Empirical Review

Nwaiwu and Momoh-Musa (2021) empirically investigated electronic payment paradigm and price earnings ratio of financial institutions in Nigeria. The study considered automated teller machine, point of sales delivery, internet banking and mobile banking as proxies of electronic banking. Secondary and annual time series data was sourced from CBN statistical bulletin and federal Inland Revenue services from 2007-2018. Ordinary least square regression analysis and error correction model were the statistical tools used. The findings revealed that electronic payment paradigm has the potency to make significant contribution to price earnings ratio and recommends that Financial Institutions need to establish more electronic payment facilities across the country.

Adekunle and Ayeni (2021) examined credit channels of financial sector development and economic growth in Nigeria. Secondary data spanning from 1986-2018 was sourced from CBN statistical bulletin. The variables of credit channels include automated teller machine, point of sales delivery and internet banking, and gross domestic product growth rate to capture economic growth. Autoregressive Distributed Lag technique (ARDL) and Bond cointegration tests were conducted. The study found and concluded that, credit to core sector and credit to government impede economic growth in the short run, with credit to core sector stimulating economic growth in the long run, the recommendation was that Credit allocated to government should be judiciously utilized for growth enhancing purposes.

Mamudu and Gayovwi (2019) studied cashless policy and its impact on the Nigerian economy. Quarterly data spanning 2011: Q1 to 2017: Q4 was sourced from Central bank of Nigeria statistical bulletin and World development indicator. The Error Correction Model (ECM) was used to carry out the analysis. The study found that the cashless policy instruments of ATM, Web, and NEFT had positive and significant impact on GDP, while, POS and mobile payment had an inverse and insignificant impact on GDP. The study recommends that cashless policy channels should be strengthened in order to achieve a full cashless policy country.

Isibor, Omankhanlen, Okoye, Achugamonu, Adebayo, Afolabi, and Ayodeji (2018) examined the impact of electronic banking technology on customers' satisfaction and economic growth in Nigeria. Elecrtronic banking indicators include automated teller machine, point of sales delivery, internet banking and mobile banking; economic growth was proxied by gross domestic product growth rate. Statistical parametric test called Pair Sample t-test through the use of SPSS statistical package was used as the analytical tool. The findings revealed that e-banking has improved both customers' satisfaction and caused economic growth in Nigeria. The study recommends adequate legislation on all aspects of e-banking so that both the operators of the system and the public can be adequately protected.

Ehiriudu, Ugwuta, and Ani (2016) empirically examined the impact of adopting electronic system of banking in Nigeria on the Economy. Electronic system of banking was proxied by automated teller machine, point of sales delivery, internet banking and

mobile banking while economic growth was measured by gross domestic product growth rate. Descriptive statistics and Ordinary least square methods were used in analyzing the data. The findings revealed that electronic system of banking has a positive and significant impact on Nigeria's economic growth, it was recommended that availability of sufficient and well-functioning infrastructural facilities can enhance the effectiveness of the channels.

Okereke (2016) investigated cashless banking transactions and economic growth of Nigeria. Secondary data on automated teller machine, point of sales delivery, internet banking and gross domestic product were sourced from the CBN statistical bulletin of various issues. The quantitative design using ordinary least- square (OLS) method of multiple regression analysis was employed. Vector Error Correction test (VERC) model, Augmented Dickey Fuller (ADF) unit root test and Johansen's Co-integration tests were also applied. The result of findings shows that only point of sales terminal was significant to economic growth while automated teller machine, mobile banking and internet banking are insignificant to economic growth within the period under study. It was recommended that government and bankers should put more effort in infrastructure development and aggressive public awareness campaigns.

Oloyede, Azeez and Aluko(2016)examined E-Commerce and E-Banking in Nigeria. Primary data was collected with the aid of questionnaire, testing using Chi-square with the aid of SPSS. The findings reveal that e-commerce and e-banking facilitates better exchange transactions, integrates the nation into the global economy, improves operational capacity and productivity of Nigerian businesses and provides avenue to boost economic growth, It recommends that government should provide adequate infrastructural facilities in the telecommunication and power sector coupled with encouraging information and communication technology usage amongst its public for more beneficial impact to be felt.

Gap in Literature

From the foregoing, most studies carried out over the years concentrated on either cashless policy and its impact on deposit money banks banking channels and connection with financial deepening, with little or no attempt at capturing alternative banking channels and its general impact on the economy in one study. This study is a more robust attempt at investigating the connectivity between the components of alternative banking and economic growth in Nigeria.

Research Methodology

For the purpose of this study, the ex-post facto research design was utilized. The sample size covered the various activities of alternative banking delivery channels, also known as electronic banking channels of all the deposit money banks in Nigeria between 2009 and 2020. The data used for this study were secondary data sourced from the central bank of Nigeria statistical bulletin between the periods 2009 to 2020. This study also made use of books and other related materials especially the banks financial report and the Nigerian Stock Exchange Fact Book (2018). The population of the study involves the entire deposit money banks' selected delivery channels in operation. For a meaningful research work to be carried out, it is necessary to indicate the meaning of the variables and its

relevancy to the operational use. Thus, the following are the operational measures of the variables utilized in this study.
Independent variables:

Point of Sales: This is the aggregate amount invested by the banks toward material and equipment towards a retail transaction, measured in millions of naira. This will be captured in millions as reported within the central bank of Nigeria statistical bulletin.

Automated Teller Machine: This is the total amount lodged on an electronic banking outlet, which allows customers to complete basic transactions without the aid of a branch representative or teller. This will be captured in millions a reported within the central bank of Nigeria statistical bulletin.

Electronic Mobile: These are the amounts expended by financial institutions towards online banking facilities and operations. This will be captured in millions a reported within the central bank of Nigeria statistical bulletin.

Internet Transaction: This comprises of various internet transaction done by bank customers at the comfort of their home without visiting the banking hall. This transaction can be done using different kind of gadget such as phone, laptop USSD codes and so on. This will be captured in millions a reported within the central bank of Nigeria statistical bulletin. The multiple regression equation models are estimated as follows:

Model estimation and specification:
GDPgr = f (POS, ATM, EMOB, INT) ………………………………………. (1)
The mathematical form of the model is written by introducing estimation parameters in the model below:

$GDPgr = a_0 + a_1 POS + a_2 ATM + a_3 EMOB + a_4 INT$ ……………………..(2)

In econometrics, the above equations 1 and 2 are not sufficient in specification due to absence of error term. Therefore, we introduce the error terms as follows;
$GDPgr = a_0 + a_1 POS + a_2 ATM + a_3 EMOB + a_4 INT + \mu_1$ ………………. (3)

Where,

GDPgr = Gross domestic product growth rate
POS = Point of Sales
ATM = Automated Teller Machine
EMOB = Electronic Mobile
INT = Internet Banking
a_0 = Constant Parameters
$a_1, a_2, \alpha_3, \alpha_4$ = Estimation parameters
μ_1 = Error term
Apriori Expectation:
On apriori $a_1, a_2, \alpha_3, \alpha_4, > 0$

A positive theoretical relationship is expected among employed variables of the study. The analysis Technique for this study is Ordinary least square method due to the nature of the study and in tandem with Okereke (2016). Under the ordinary least square methodology, the following characters will be considered ;(i) Coefficient of Determination (R^2): The R- squared measures the goodness of fit. It shows the percentage of the total variations in the dependent variable that is explained by the independent or explanatory variable.

This indicates that R^2 is measured in percentage. (ii) T- test: This is used to test the validity of the parameter estimate. In other words, it is used to decide whether the estimate independent variable is significant or not. (iii) F-test: The F- test follows the F- distribution at 5% level of significance. It is therefore used to find out whether the overall parameter is significant or not. (iv) Durbin- Watson test: This test is used to verify the existence of autocorrelation in the

estimated model. Autocorrelation refers to the interaction that exists between error terms of various observations.

Presentation and Description of Results

The result of the multiple regression shows that out of the four proxies for electronic banking delivery channels, one showed the existence of significant relationships while three proved to be insignificant in stimulating gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria.

Although the essence of ordinary least square is to show that nature of the static short run relationship among the series. As such, the result reports the existence of a positive and significant relationship between point of sales transaction and gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria. By implication, this suggests that POS transaction has significantly stimulated economic performance which in turn spills over into the Nigerian economy.

Further, electronic mobile banking transaction reacted significantly to gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria, with a positive coefficient. This suggests that any increase in electronic mobile banking transaction would cause output of gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria to increase to the tune of 0.000327 unit all things been equal. However, internet banking and ATM exhibited a negative coefficient of -0.0000065 and -0.0000000463 alongside an insignificant P-value of 0.3412 and 0.4064 respectively which implies the existence of negative and insignificant relationship between the series.

Finally, the adjusted R-square stood at 0.602900 thus suggesting that about 60-unit variation in gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria performance is accounted for by electronic banking indices considered under this study. The Durbin Watson statistics exhibited an average coefficient of 1.7909 which implies the absence of auto correlation thus suggesting that the report from this study can be used for decision making.

Test of Hypotheses; the result of the Multiple regression is used in testing the hypothesis cited in chapter one to enable us discuss our findings and make recommendations. The P-value alongside its corresponding coefficient will be used in this section.

Hypothesis One

Ho_1: Automated Teller Machine has no significant relationship with gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria.

H_{A1}: Automated Teller Machine has a significant relationship with gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria. Following the report of the multiple regressions, Automated Teller Machine exhibited a negative coefficient of -0.000000463i alongside an insignificant P-value of 0.4064 thus suggested the existence of inverse relationship among the series. As such, we do not reject the null hypothesis and thus conclude that Automated Teller Machine has no significant relationship with gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria, this is in line with the study of Ahmadu(2014).

Hypothesis Two

Ho_2: There is no significant relationship between Point of Sale and gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria.

H_{A2}: There is a significant relationship between Point of Sale and gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria. Still in line with the result of the multiple regression, Point of Sale exhibited a positive coefficient of 0.00000500 alongside a

significant P-value of 0.0024 which further implies the existence of a direct relationship among the series. Based on this report, we reject the null hypothesis and thus conclude that there is a significant relationship between Point of Sale and gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria, the results of this finding is in tandem with Adekunle and Ayeni (2021).

Hypothesis Three

Ho$_3$**:** Electronic Banking has no significant relationship with gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria.

H$_{A3}$: Electronic Banking has a significant relationship with gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria. Report of the multiple regression result provided an evidence to assert that electronic mobile transaction exhibited a positive coefficient of 0.000000327 alongside a significant P-value of 0.0013 which also suggest the existence of a positive relationship among the series.

As such, we reject the null hypothesis and thus conclude that Electronic Banking has a significant relationship with gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria, the result of the finding is in agreement with that of Edoka and Anyanwaokoro (2019).

Hypothesis Four

Ho$_4$**:** Significant relationship does not exist between Internet Banking and gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria.

H$_{A4}$: Significant relationship does exist between Internet Banking and gross domestic product growth rate in Nigeria. Finding shows that internet transaction exhibited a negative coefficient of -172.878 and a significant P-value of 0.0145 which provided an evidence of direct relationship among the study variables. As such, we reject the null hypothesis and thus conclude that significant relationship exist between internet transaction and gross domestic

product growth rate in Nigeria, the findings agree with that of Jonathan and Uju (2019).

Summary, Conclusions And Recommendations

The role of alternative banking delivery channels or electronic banking in stimulating economic growth in Nigeria cannot be underestimated. Apart from reducing the risk of caring hard currency everywhere you go, it has subsequently reduced the risk of cash mobilization through its window of cashless policy. Studies have revealed that this has influenced, gross domestic product performance, bank performance and therefore a possibility of influencing general economic outcomes, hence, necessitate the need for this study. Results of the study provide evidence supporting the fact that Point of Sale Transactions and Electronic Mobile Banking Transactions has a significant relationship with performance of gross domestic product. The prevailing relationship is indicated by its significant P-value alongside a positive coefficient. Further, ATM and INT exhibited a negative coefficient alongside an insignificant P-value thus suggesting an inverse relationship.

The negative coefficient of ATM and INT contribution to gross domestic product performance could be attributed to high volume of fraudulent activities associated with these versions of E-banking transactions and excessive charges on such transactions which could result to financial exclusion. Hence, ATM and INT bank transactions are more prone to fraud in comparison with other forms of cashless policy/electronic banking measures. The study considered the relationship between selected e-banking/cashless policy measures in Nigeria which include (ATM, POS, electronic mobile

and internet banking) and how it impacts on economic growth between the periods 2009-2020 using quarterly data. Based on our findings, we conclude that of the four proxies for cashless policy/electronic banking considered under this study, two appear to be significant in promoting the general economic condition in Nigeria. It was recommended also that the monetary policy makers should endeavor to continually regulate banks and monitor the cost associated with transactions in the cashless society. The cost should significantly be reduced to encourage more citizens to participate. There is need for regular Public Enlightenment Awareness campaign about the cashless economy so that everyone will be well educated and familiarized with it. Such campaign is an opportunity to make people also understand the consequences of the cashless economy.

The development of the innovation of electronic banking has the potential to transform economic activity and achieve developmental goals. If an effective electronic banking system can be developed, then it will have a desired impact on the Nigeria economy. Therefore, trusted central bank and government must play a key role in promoting the development of popular forms e-banking channels.

This study concludes with a final observation about the central bank's role in the development of the payment system. Over the next decade, there would be progress towards a cashless society both in Nigeria and other countries. In the presence of these trends, the responsibility of the central bank is to anticipate such change and channel it in such a way to ensure the safety, efficiency and effectiveness of domestic and international banking system. The policy involves a culture change which will naturally

take some time to gain societal acceptance. Such a transformation policy although plausible needs gradual implementation preceded by aggressive public enlightenment. Specifically, more media platforms different languages with local means of communication should be deployed to market the new policy across the country. The following recommendation are suggested; The policy is commendable given the fact that transactions in goods and services in the Nigerian economy are heavily cash –based, this imposes enormous cost on the banking system and customer inform of high rates and other charges. The underpinning theories employed in this work are theories arising from the decomposed theory of planned behaviour.

These theories consider that the use of technology is influenced by attitude, subjective norm and perceived behavioural control. The theories argue that the lesser the ratio of currency outside banks to broad money supply the higher the intermediation efficiency and vice-versa. This suffices that when the currency outside banks diminishes as a result of the increase in the use of electronic forms of payment, particularly ATM and other e-card products, as well as banking habits, the intermediation efficiency will be positive, otherwise it will be negative. With the advent of technology and increasing use of smartphone and tablet based devices, the use of mobile banking functionality would enable customers connect across entire customer life cycle much comprehensively than before.

With this scenario, current mobile banking objectives of say building relationships, reducing cost, achieving new revenue stream will transform to enable new objectives targeting higher level goals such

as building brand of the banking organization.

References

Adekunle, O.E., and Ayeni, T.O. (2021) Credit Channels of Financial Sector Development and Economic Growth in Nigeria.*Journal of Public Administration, Finance and Law, 19, 85-92.*

Agu, A. O., and Agu S. V. (2020) Cashless Policy and the Nigerian Economy: A Disaggregated Approach. *International Journal of Humanities Social Sciences and Education, 7, (4), 21-30.*

Ahmadu A. (2014) The Effects of Electronic Banking on Growth of Deposit Money Banks in Nigeria. *European Journal of Business and Management, 6 (33)79-89.*

Ajayi, I. B. (2014). Effect of cashless monetary policy on Nigerian banking industry: issues, prospects and challenges: *International Journal of Business and Finance Management Research*, 2(1), 23 – 34

.

Babatunde, M.O. and Salawudeen, M.O. (2017). Analysis of the Impact of Electronic Banking on Customers' Satisfaction in Nigeria.*Greener Journal of Business and Management, 7(3),30-42.*

Babatunde O. and Sunday O. (2017) E-Banking in Nigeria: Issues and Challenges. *Research Journal of Finance and Accounting, 8(6), 16-24.*

Chijioke E. and Paulinus C. M. (2019). An Assessment of the Impact of E-Banking on Nigeria's Economic Growth, 2008 – 2018. *International Journal of Management, Accounting and Economics, 6(6), 454-466.*

Chukwu, M.A., and Idoko, E.C. (2021). Inhibitors of Electronic Banking Platforms' Usage Intention in Deposit Money Banks: Perspectives of Elderly Customers in Developing Economy.*Sch Bull, 7(5): 134-145.*

Edoka, P. R.and Anyanwaokoro, M. (2019). Electronic Payment System and Financial Deepening in Nigeria, 2009-2017. *South Asian Journal of Social Studies and Economics, 4(1): 1-14.*

Ehiriudu J. A., Ugwuta, E.E. and Ani, M. U. (2016). The Impact of Adopting Electronic Banking in Nigeria Economy: Issues and Challenges. *European Journal of Business and Management, 8(23), 35-39.*

Ene, E.E., Abba, G.O. and Fatokun, G.F. (2019). The impact of electronic banking on financial Inclusion in Nigeria.*American Journal of Industrial and Business Management, 9, 1409-1422.*

Eze, G. P. and Egoro, S. (2016) Electronic Banking and Profitability of Commercial Banks in Nigeria. *Journal of Finance and Economic Research, 3(1), 202-222.*

Idoko, C. U., Ibrahim Y. and Bala P. D. (2015). E – Banking Reform and National Development in Nigeria. *Global Journal of Human-Social Science: E Economics, 15(2), 1-5.*

Isibor, A.A., Omankhanlen, A.E., Okoye, L.U., Achugamonu, B.U., Adebayo, M.T., Afolabi,

G.T., Ayodeji, O.E. (2018) Impact of Electronic Banking Technology on Customers' Satisfaction and Economic Growth in Nigeria.*International Journal of Civil Engineering and Technology, 9(12), 536–544.*

Jonathan O. O., and Uju V. O. (2019) Impact of Electronic Banking on the Performance of Money Deposit Banks in Nigeria. *Noble International Journal of Economics and Financial Research, 4(9),83-90.*

Mamudu, Z.U., and Gayovwi, G.O. (2019). Cashless policy and its impact on the Nigerian economy. *International Journal of Education and Research, 7(3), 111132.*

Nwaiwu, J.N. and Momoh-Musa, A (2021) Electronic Payment Paradigm and Price Earnings Ratio of Financial Institutions in Nigeria. *International Journal on Integrated Education, 4(5), 208-241.*

Okafor, C. A. (2021) Electronic Banking and Entrepreneurial Development in Nigeria. *International Journal of Business & Law Research 9(1):79-88.*

Okereke, J. U. (2016) Cashless Banking Transactions and Economic Growth of Nigeria. *Middle-East Journal of Scientific Research 24 (11): 3576-3581.*

Olorunsegun, P.J (2010) E- Banking in Nigeria: Issues and Challenges." *Research Journal of Finance and Accounting, 8(6), 1624.*

Oloyede, J. A., Azeez, B. A. and Aluko, A. O. (2016) E-Commerce and E-Banking in Nigeria.*The International Journal of Management, 1(3), 1-14.*

Onodugo, I. C. (2015).Overview of electronic banking in Nigeria.*International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research and Development, 2(7), 336-342.*

Siyanbola, M.O. (2013) Alternative Banking Channels and Customers' Satisfaction: An Empirical Study of Public and Private Sector Banks.*International Journal of Business and Management Tomorrow, 1(1), 1-24.*

Appendix
Presentation of Empirical Result
Table 2: Presentation of Ordinary Least Square Result

Dependent Variable: GDPGR
Method: Least Squares
Date: 14/07/21 Time: 14:32
Sample: 2009Q1 2020Q4
Included observations: 48

Variable	Coefficient	Std. Error	t-Statistic	Prob.
C	6.598112	2.146318	3.222973	0.0027
ATM	-4.63E-08	5.51E-08	-0.840291	0.4064
EMOB	3.27E-07	2.37E-06	0.137611	0.0013
INT	-6.54E-06	6.78E-06	-0.964836	0.3412

POS	5.00E-06	3.77E-06	1.329163	0.0024

R-squared	0.611577	Mean dependent var	7.346250
Adjusted R-squared	0.602900	S.D. dependent var	10.39814
S.E. of regression	9.107130	Akaike info criterion	7.372461
Sum squared resid	2902.893	Schwarz criterion	7.583571
Log likelihood	-142.4492	Hannan-Quinn criter.	7.448792
F-statistic	3.960215	Durbin-Watson stat	1.790926
Prob(F-statistic)	0.009380		

Source: Extraction from E-views